DIGITALES ARCHIV

ZBW – Leibniz-Informationszentrum Wirtschaft ZBW – Leibniz Information Centre for Economics

Bass, Alexander

Article

Does oil prices uncertainty affect stock returns in Russia : a bivariate generalized autoregressive conditional heteroskedasticity-in-mean approach

International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy

Provided in Cooperation with: International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy (IJEEP)

Reference: Bass, Alexander (2017). Does oil prices uncertainty affect stock returns in Russia : a bivariate generalized autoregressive conditional heteroskedasticity-in-mean approach. In: International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy 7 (4), S. 224 - 230.

This Version is available at: http://hdl.handle.net/11159/1279

Kontakt/Contact ZBW – Leibniz-Informationszentrum Wirtschaft/Leibniz Information Centre for Economics Düsternbrooker Weg 120 24105 Kiel (Germany) E-Mail: *rights[at]zbw.eu* https://www.zbw.eu/

Standard-Nutzungsbedingungen:

Dieses Dokument darf zu eigenen wissenschaftlichen Zwecken und zum Privatgebrauch gespeichert und kopiert werden. Sie dürfen dieses Dokument nicht für öffentliche oder kommerzielle Zwecke vervielfältigen, öffentlich ausstellen, aufführen, vertreiben oder anderweitig nutzen. Sofern für das Dokument eine Open-Content-Lizenz verwendet wurde, so gelten abweichend von diesen Nutzungsbedingungen die in der Lizenz gewährten Nutzungsrechte. Alle auf diesem Vorblatt angegebenen Informationen einschließlich der Rechteinformationen (z.B. Nennung einer Creative Commons Lizenz) wurden automatisch generiert und müssen durch Nutzer:innen vor einer Nachnutzung sorgfältig überprüft werden. Die Lizenzangaben stammen aus Publikationsmetadaten und können Fehler oder Ungenauigkeiten enthalten.

https://savearchive.zbw.eu/termsofuse

Terms of use:

This document may be saved and copied for your personal and scholarly purposes. You are not to copy it for public or commercial purposes, to exhibit the document in public, to perform, distribute or otherwise use the document in public. If the document is made available under a Creative Commons Licence you may exercise further usage rights as specified in the licence. All information provided on this publication cover sheet, including copyright details (e.g. indication of a Creative Commons license), was automatically generated and must be carefully reviewed by users prior to reuse. The license information is derived from publication metadata and may contain errors or inaccuracies.





Leibniz-Informationszentrum Wirtschaft Leibniz Information Centre for Economics



INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL

International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy

ISSN: 2146-4553

available at http://www.econjournals.com

International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy, 2017, 7(4), 224-230.



Does Oil Prices Uncertainty Affect Stock Returns in Russia: A Bivariate Generalized Autoregressive Conditional Heteroskedasticity-in-Mean Approach

Alexander Bass*

Department of Financial Markets & Banks, Financial University under the Government of the Russian Federation, Moscow, Russia. *Email: alexbass1947@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

In this article, we explore the dependence of the volatility of stock returns and the world oil prices on the example of Russia. Using weekly data for the variables for the period from January 01, 2003 by May 01, 2017, we define the uncertainty of oil prices as the conditional standard deviation of the one-step-ahead forecast error for changes in oil prices. A bivariate generalized autoregressive conditional heteroskedasticity-in-mean vector autoregressive model is used for the study. The results of the study show that, given oil prices are denominated in US dollars, the uncertainty of oil prices has a positive and statistically significant impact on stock returns. Also as a result of research, we come to the conclusion that in case of Russia, the uncertainty of oil prices in the equation "oil price-stock returns" leads to an increased positive response of stock returns to a positive oil price shock, while increasing the sensitivity of stock returns to negative oil price shock in comparison with the model, not taking into account the uncertainty of oil prices. The analysis also showed that the response of stock returns to positive and negative oil price shocks uncertainty is asymmetric.

Keywords: Oil Prices, Stock Returns, Volatility, Generalized Autoregressive Conditional Heteroskedasticity, Emerging Market JEL Classifications: C32, G10, G15, Q43

1. INTRODUCTION

Modern economic environment is characterized by high volatility and uncertainty. World energy market is no exception. Volatility is an important characteristic of world oil prices. This is due to the widespread use of energy as a source for the production of goods of intermediate and final consumption (Swanepoel, 2006). In this context, the volatility in world oil prices has the potential to substantially impact on world markets of goods, services and capital. On the other hand, the volatility in world oil prices may be detrimental to the development of national markets, which is causing concern in the political, economic and expert circles. In this regard, the research community has been devoting considerable attention to this issue. Particularly significant is the question of the relationship between the volatility of oil prices and the macroeconomic state of the economy. Speaking about the state of research can be divided into two main areas. Some researchers dedicate work to the search of the impact of world oil prices on investment, economic growth, household behavior,

the other on the background of the global financial crisis and its consequences increasingly focused on stock market, loan capital markets. This study aims to test the hypothesis on the relationship between volatility of oil prices and the securities market on the example of Russia. It is no secret that Russia, being an oil exporter is exposed to volatility in oil prices. The question is to determine the positive or negative nature of this effect and its magnitude.

In the classical theory, asset prices depend on expected discounted cash flows (Fisher, 1930; Williams, 1938). According to this theory we can assume that the combination of endogenous and exogenous factors with a potential impact on expected discounted flows can affect asset prices traded in markets. So, a positive shock in oil prices should lead, ceteris paribus, increase the cost of production, reduction of potential profit. For the holders of the securities (excluding the holders of the shares of oil companies), this shock may lead to reduction of capitalization of the shareholder. Then, we can assume that a positive shock in oil prices may lead to a drop in the stock price (Filis et al., 2011). In the case of oil-exporting countries, a positive demand shock in the oil prices should lead to an increase in the cost of securities and economic growth. To such conclusions came Bjornland (2009) and Jimenez-Rodriguez and Sanchez (2005). The increase of yield national securities leads to an increase of macroeconomic variables, which leads to an increase in aggregate expenditure and investment, leading to employment growth and labor efficiency i.e., in the case of oilexporting countries, the effect should be the opposite.

However, these laws do not apply to oil-importing countries. A positive shock in oil prices will have a more negative impact (LeBlanc and Chinn, 2004; Hooker, 2002). This negative effect is due to the fact that oil is one of the major factors of production used by entrepreneurs and households. This leads to a rise in costs (Filis et al., 2011; Arouri and Nguyen, 2010; Backus and Crucini, 2000; Kim and Loungani, 1992). This price increase is transferred to entrepreneurs and households, leading to bouts of inflation (rising prices) and falling demand from households with a high elasticity demand function (Bernanke, 2006; Hamilton, 1988). Falling demand and rising inflation expectations lead to a decline in production and employment (Lardic and Mignon, 2006; Brown and Yücel, 2002; Davis and Haltiwanger, 2001). The logical conclusion of this spiral is the deterioration of the macroeconomic environment and the negative reaction of the stock market (Sadorsky, 1999; Jones and Kaul, 1996). Filis et al. (2011) pointed out that shocks in oil prices can influence the stock market through the uncertainty, which in turn affect the stock market depending on the side: On the supply side or the demand. If the shock in oil prices from the demand side - the reaction of the stock market can be positive, if on the supply side, it is negative. The importance of oil prices for the stock market as a source of information also emphasizes and Ross (1989).

An important aspect of the research question is the symmetry or asymmetry of the effect of the shock of oil prices on stock markets. In other words, is a proportionate (balanced) response of stock markets to positive and negative oil shocks. Sadorsky (1999) cites two possible explanations for an asymmetric reaction of the stock market to positive and negative shocks. The first explanation is due to the fact that the shocks are sectoral in nature and affect individual sectors of the economy. In other words, the main role is played by the change in relative prices. The second explanation is associated with irreversible investments under uncertainty. Under this approach, an important role time preferences play in investing. For example, Hamilton (1988), using a multi-sector model of the economy, concludes that the movement of labor and capital across sectors is costly, in connection with the costs of the training and mobility of labor in the national economy. In the given conditions, the relative price shock reduces the employment rate: Workers in the affected sectors will likely be left temporarily unemployed until recovery of the sector, rather than move on to another. In the case of the assumptions about the irreversible investment, the organization may face a dilemma: In the case of oil shock, increase of the basic capital at the expense of energy efficient or energy inefficient capital. The growing uncertainty of energy prices, when triggered by the volatility of oil prices leads to the necessity of determining the optimum time for investment. The decline in oil prices may be offset by higher uncertainty. Many authors come to the conclusion that the sharp jumps in oil prices (both growth and decline) lead to higher volatility, and that, in turn, leads to volatility in investment, production and consumption. Also sharp spikes in oil prices lead to asymmetric responses in different sectors (Guo and Kliesen, 1995; Elder and Serletis, 2010; Baskaya et al., 2013).

Unfortunately, today a large part of the literature on the topic investigates the impact of shocks in oil prices on different sectors of the real economy. For example, the impact of oil prices on exchange rate and economic growth for oil exporting countries is studied in Burakov (2016). For the real sector of oil exporting countries of great importance is the emigration concerns. E.g., Burakov (2016) has identified a transmission channel of oil shocks in economic growth and emigration decisions of the population. A brilliant study by Ozturk and Feridun (2010) shows that a positive oil shock tends to increase inflation on domestic markets in case of Turkey as an oil-importing country.

The impact of the uncertainty of oil prices on the stock market of the national economy are investigated insufficiently. The paucity of such studies basically apply to developing countries. This study aims to empirically test and determine the quantitative parameters of the oil price shock effect on the profitability of the Russian stock market. Unlike existing studies, we apply impulse response analysis to assess the recovery rate of stock returns to the state preceding the shock. We also set ourselves the task to determine the presence/absence of symmetry in the reaction of stock market to a shock in oil prices uncertainty. Framework the study is based on the use of two-dimensional. In the framework of structural vector autoregression (VAR) is modified to accommodate bivariate generalized autoregressive conditional heteroskedasticity (GARCH)-in-mean errors. This platform is characterized by the fact that all parameters are estimated simultaneously by full information maximum likelihood in order to avoid the generated regressor problems, which was written in Pagan (1984). The measurement of uncertainty in this study, the conditional standard deviation of the one-step-ahead forecast error for the change in the price of oil.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

This section aims to reveal the current status of research on the question of the relationship of uncertainty of oil prices and stock market prices and oil-exporting countries. Unfortunately, to date most of the research on this issue is carried out on the example of developed countries. A number of studies of developing countries are limited and scarce. A brief literature review on the research question is presented in Table 1.

Given the presented in Table 1 results of literature review of the study, we can draw several conclusions. First, research, concentrated specifically on developing countries is few, which underlines the relevance and significance of our research. Second, existing studies are mostly devoted to the analysis of the relationship between oil prices and the market value of the securities. Studies of the impact of the shock of uncertainty of oil prices on stock markets, are almost absent. Thirdly, the results of previous studies are of somewhat ambivalent nature, and the

Anthor (ver) Anthor (ver) Anthor (ver) Asymetric Agren (2006) Stock markets of Japan, Norway, Sweden, the UK, and the US Asymetric hFKK, model International multi-factor model excluding Sweden, the UK, and the US Sadorsky (1999) Oil price insk and 21 energing stock market returns International multi-factor model Exclusing Sweden, the UK (and) by the US (technology, even (2009) International multi-factor model Exclusing Sweden, the UK (and) by the US (technology, even (2009) International multi-factor model Exclusing Sweden, the UK (and) by the US (technology, even (2009) International multi-factor model Exclusing Sweden, the US (technology, even (2009) International multi-factor model Exclusing Sweden, the US (technology, even (2009) International multi-factor model Exclusing Sweden, the US (technology, even (2009) International model Exclusing Sweden, the US (technology, even (2009) International model Exclusing Sweden, the US (technology, even (2009) International model Exclusing Sweden, the US (technology, even (2000) International model Exclusing Sweden, the US (technology, even (2000) International model Exclusing Sweden, the US (technology, even (2000) International model Exclusing Sweden (technology, even (2000) International model Exclusing Sweden (technology, even (2000) Exclusing Sweden (technology, even (2000)	A the stand		M. (L. J.L.	D 1/ .
Age of Looving Shock markets on Lapan, Norway, and the Variable Stady Stad	Author (year)	Staals markets of Israer News	A aummetric DEVU	Volotility milloyon from all miners to start used at
Sudorsky (1999) Oil price insk and 21 energing stock market returns Oil price insk and 21 energing stock market returns Oil price insk and 21 energing stock market returns Oil price insk and 21 energing stock market in Buropa oil and stock sectors in Buropa oil and stock starter in Buropa oil and stock strater in Buropa oil prices free strate strater prices and Sampling of the strater prices and sampling	Agren (2000)	Stock markets of Japan, Norway,	Asymmetric BEKK	volating spinover nom on prices to stock markets exist,
Sadorsky (1999) Oil price risk and 21 energing stock market returns on stock market returns on emerging markets is found itself vigating (2009) International multi-factor model its vigation (2004) Maila and Oil prices and three equity sector returns in emerging markets is found obtainity transmission between oil and stock markets in Europe and the United States at the sector and the Univariate regime returns in emerging markets is found. Volatility cross effects and proces and State States at the sector and the United Statese at the United States at the sector and the United S		Sweden, the UK, and the US	model	excluding Sweden; volatility spillovers are quantitatively
Satorsy (1999) Oil price is and 2 i energing such market returns of Direct returns in the Stock markets is found international multi-factor model is fiverance (SARCII model) invaria (SARCII and stock ararkets in Europe and the Using Stock prices Arouri et al. (2011) Videality staminission between oil and stock sectors in Europe and the Unied States at the sector level is considered in the sector is solved prices. The States of returns is found. Workprice and spinicant inductations in the sector in the sector while bilateral spillover of volatility between oil and stock sectors in Europe while bilateral spillover of stock markets in Europe and the Unied States at the sector is solved sectors in Europe while bilateral spillover of stock markets in Europe and the Unied States at the sector is solved sectors in Europe while bilateral spillover of stock sectors in Europe while bilateral spillover of stock sectors in Europe while bilateral spillover of stock markets in Europe and the University correlation between UTI oil mover the sector stock sectors in Europe while bilateral spillover of stock markets in Europe while bilateral spillover spillower diffect and observed in the Unied States at the spillow increasing correlation analysis Files et al. (2011) Time-varying corelation between in the spillower diffect spillover spillower diffect spillower diffect spillower diffect spillower diffect s	G = 1 = -1 = (1000)	0:1	T	small although statistically significant
Maik and OU prices and three quity sector Fewing (2009) multi-factor model Bivaria CARCH returns in the CS (technology, models returns in the CS (technology, models Arouri et al. (2011) Volatility transmission between oil and stock markets in Europe and the United States at the sector level Generalized A widespread direct spillower of volatility between oil and stock sector returns is found. Volatility cross effects run only from oil to stock sectors in Europe while bilateral spillower offects are observed in the United States Lee and Choi (2011) Relationship between WTI oil prices and S and P 500 returns Universite regime writching GARCH model Nesults show, that when there are significant fluctuations states The US Symmetric DCC-GARCH model Contemporaneous for oil-importing US, Germany and Netterhads) and oil-exporting countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil) Contemporaneous for oil-importing US, Germany and Netterhads) and oil-exporting countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil) Contemporaneous for oil-importing US, Germany and Netterhads) and oil-exporting countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil) VEC model Negative impact oil price and stock returns Masih et al. (2011) South Korea VEC model Negative impact oil price and stock returns Juinit (2013) World oil price and stock sectors in samid Arabia stock returns of 10 worldwide oil price and stock markets in Europe and stock sectors in function in stock arakets in Europe and stock sectors in function in stock arakets in Europe and stock sectors in function in the Stock Exchange of Thalland he US S and P 500 VAR-GARCH model, partwise for oin price and stock marke	Sadorsky (1999)	Oil price risk and 21 emerging	International	Evidence that oil price risk positively impacts stock price
Mailt and Eveng (2009) Oppose and the cylic terturns in the US (technology, model Divariate UARCH Eveng (2009) Existence of negative and significant flationship prices Arouri et al. (2011) India dock markets in Europe and the US (technology, level Generalized and stock markets in Europe and the US (technology, level Avidespread direct spillover of volatility cross effects and stock sectors in Europe while bitaeral spillover effects are observed in the United States Lee and Choi add Hammoude/(2010) The US Universite regime switching GARCH model Results show, that when there are significant flatutations in oil prices, the resultant unexpected asymmetric price changes lead to negative impacts on S and P 500 returns, but the result does not bold in a regime of lower oil price flatutations Filis et al. (2011) The US Symmetric DC contemporaneous for oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting Correlation nereases positivel (negative) in respond to important aggregate demands ide (precautionary demand) oil price shocks, arising from global business cycle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation denses to ito many and Netherlands) and oil-exporting Correlation increases positivel (negative) in respond to important aggregate demand oil price and stock returns a stock returns a 10 worldivel oil companies Jouini (2013) World oil price and stock sector in Saudi Arabia VAR-GARCH approach watche is floand to important aggregate demand oil price does not volatility spillovers between oil price and stock returns a 10 worldivel oil companies Arouri et al. (2014) Impact of oil price u	N (1'1)	stock market returns	multi-factor model	returns in emerging markets is found
Leving (2009) returns in the US (technology, healthcare are docusture services) models between the sector in dec returns and volatility of oil prices Arouri et al. (2011) Volatility transmission between oil and stock markets in Furye level Generalized A widespread direct spillover of volatility between oil and stock sector returns is found. Volatility cross effects approach Lee and Chioa (2011) Relationship between WTI oil prices and S and P 500 returns Univariate regime switching GARCH model Results show, that when there are significant fluctuations Choia add The US Symmetric DCC-GARCI model Not the result does not hold in a regime of lower oil price fluctuations Filis et al. (2011) Time-varying correlation between stock market prices and oil-exporting or l-importing (US, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil) Contemporaneous ecrelation malysis Results show that time-varying active bit decreasing correlation with the S and P 500 index Mash et al. (2011) World oil price and stock sectors in saudi. Anabia VEC model Negative inpact of oil price volatility or real stock market returns of 10 worldwide oil componits Chang et al. (2012) World oil price and stock sectors in saudi. Anabia VEC model Significant volatility spillovers between oil price and stock returns of 10 worldwide oil componits Arouri et al. (2012) World oil price incertai	Malik and	Oil prices and three equity sector	Bivariate GARCH	Existence of negative and significant relationship
Anuri et al. (2011)Interfact and consumer services) of and stock markets in Europe and the United States at the sector levelprices Availagreed direct spillover of volatility between oil and stock sector returns is found. Volatility cross effects and the United States at the sector bitateral apillover effects are observed in the United StatesLee and Chiou (2011)Relationship between WTI oil proces and 8 and P 500 returns swiching GARCH modelConverting GARCH modelResults show that when there are significant fluctuations in oil prices. The resultant unexpected apyrmetric price changes lead to negative impacts on S and P 500 returns, but the result does not bold in a regime of lower oil price fluctuationsChoi and Hammoudch (2010)The USSymmetric DC-GARCH modelResults show increasing correlations among Brent O.W. WTI oil, coper, gold and silver but decreasing correlation analysis correlation analysis correlation and oil-exporting countries (Canada, and oil-exporting countries (Canada, and oil-exporting countries (Canada, and oil-exporting countries of 10 worldwide oil procesh modelNasih et al. (2011)Mash et al. (2011)South KoreaVEC modelVEC model approach modelsMash et al. (2011)South KoreaVAR-GARCH approach modelsVolatility spillovers between oil price and stock returns of 10 worldwide oil ore-fluction analysisJuimi (2013)World oil price and stock sectors is Saudi Arabia and stock markets in Europe and stock markets in Europe and stock markets in FuropeVAR-GARCH approach approach modelJuanyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of Thailand <br< td=""><td>Ewing (2009)</td><td>returns in the US (technology,</td><td>models</td><td>between the sector index returns and volatility of oil</td></br<>	Ewing (2009)	returns in the US (technology,	models	between the sector index returns and volatility of oil
Arouri et al. (2011) Volatility transmission between oil and stock sector terms is found. Volatility personellices level A widespread direct spullover filest aro observed in the United States and stock sector terms is found. Volatility personellices in and stock sector terms is found. Volatility cross filest prices and S and P 500 returns Choia (2011) Relationship between WTI oil prices and S and P 500 returns Univariate regime switching GARCH model Results show, that when there are significant fluctuations in oil prices, the resultant unexpected asymmetric price changes lead to negative impacts on S and P 500 returns, but the result does not hold in a regime of lower oil price fluctuations Choi and Hammoudeh (2010) The US Symmetric price Symmetric Contemportaneous for oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherland). Contemportaneous for oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherland). VEC model VEC model Arous et al. (2011) Wurd oil price and stock sectors in saudi. Arabia VEC model Significant volatility spillovers between oil and stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companies Juuini (2013) World oil price uncertainty on the Stock ratics in Europe and quity markets on the stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companies VAR-GARCH approach Significant volatility spillovers between oil price dans to companies Jiranyakul (2014) Impact of oi		healthcare and consumer services)	~	prices
ol and stock markets in Europe and the United States at the sector levelVARGARCH approach approach modeland stock sector returns is found. Volatility cross effects bitateral spillover effects are observed in the United StatesLee and Chiou (2011)Relationship between WTI oil prices and S and P 500 returns modelUnivariate regime modelResults show, that when there are significant fluctuations in oil prices, the resultant unexpected asymmetric price fluctuationsChoi and Hammoudeh (2010)The USSymmetric prices and O price fluctuationsResults show increasing correlation among Brent in CC-GARCH modelHammoudeh (2010)Time-varying correlation between stock market prices and oil prices for oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting Countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)Contemporaneous ecorelation analysisResults show increasing correlation results show that infifer for oil-importing and oil-exporting conomies, the correlation states arising from global business ecorelation increases positively (negatively) in respond denard) oil price shocks arising from global businessMasih et al. (2011)South KoreaVEC model Notaritiy spillovers between oil approach approach approach approachVAR-GARCH Multivariate GARCH modelsArouri et al. (2012)KoreaVAR-GARCH Multivariate GARCH modelsSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sectors stock returns are found. Observed spillover effect as all neignificant approach approachJiranyakal (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of Flailand Goldman Sach's Energy Index and testsA vivariate G	Arouri et al. (2011)	Volatility transmission between	Generalized	A widespread direct spillover of volatility between oil
and the United States at the sector level bevel bitareal splitover affects are observed in the United States bitareal splitover affects are observed asymmetric price changes lead to negative impacts on S and P 500 returns, but the result does not hold in a regime of 500 index, results show increasing correlation does not differ for oil-importing cus, Gremany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil) bitareal splitover offects are observed in the splitover offect in all stock markets regime and stock sectors bitareal splitover offects are observed asymmetric price and stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companies bitareal splitover offect real stock returns are found. Observed splitover and stock markets in Europe and equity markets offect and splitover offect real stock returns found and stock market returns found and s		oil and stock markets in Europe	VARGARCH	and stock sector returns is found. Volatility cross effects
levelbilateral spillover effects are observed in the United StatesLee andRelationship between WTI oilUnivariate regimeResults show, that when here are significant Inductations in oil prices witching GARCHChoiu (2011)Fies and S and P 500 returns. but the result does not hold in a regime of lower oil price functationsChoi andThe USSymmetricResults show increasing correlation among Brent Hammoudch (2010)Filis et al. (2011)Time-varying correlation between for oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting to contention analysisGontemporaneous correlation markets prices and oil prices to important agregate demand-side (precautionary demand) oil prices hocks arising from global business experison and side (precautionary demand) oil prices hocks arising from global business in Saudi Arabia a garoach a stock returns of 10 worldwide oil emporationVEC modelNegative impacts of in price and stock returnsMain et al. (2011)South KoreaVEC modelNegative impact of oil price onlability spillovers between oil molesVaR-GARCH Multivariate GARCHMain et al. (2011)South KoreaVAR-GARCHSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and stock sectors in Saudi Arabia ad stock markets in Europe and stock markets in EuropeVaR-GARCH Multivariate GARCH modelsJiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price und stock sectors in Saudi Arabia ad stock markets in EuropeVAR-GARCH modelsSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sector stock returns are found. Observed spillover effect come entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that approach ad stock mar		and the United States at the sector	approach	run only from oil to stock sectors in Europe while
Le and Chiou (2011) prices and S and P 500 returns witching GARCH model witching GARCH harmoodel (2010) The US market is a specific or and p 500 returns, but the result unexpocted asymmetric prices harmoodel (2010) The US market is constrained or angine of lower of liprice fluctuations Filis et al. (2011) The US market is and P 500 returns, and Netherlands) and oil-exporting contrained or angine of lower of liprice for oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting contrained or angine of lower of liprice for oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting contrained or angine of lower of liprice for oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting contrained or angine of lower of liprice for oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting contrained or angine of lower of liprice shocks, arising from global business cycle's fluctuations. Laggergate develoation results show that to inprice shocks, arising from global business cycle's fluctuations. Laggergate develoation results show that to inprice shocks, arising from global business cycle's fluctuations. Laggergate develoation results show that to inprice shocks, arising from global business cycle's fluctuations. Laggergate develoation results show that to inprice shocks, arising from global business cycle's fluctuations. Laggergate develoation results show that stock returns full cruss of 10 worldwide oil companies and stock markets in Europe and cquity markets of the oil price uncertainty on the US and P 500 to stock market is found companies for oil price uncertainty on the tot Stoch market returns, busing fluctures for oil price volatility and volatility spillovers between oil and to US and P 500 volatility and volatility and cquity markets of therage for oi		level		bilateral spillover effects are observed in the United
Lee and Chiou (2011) Relationship between WTi oil prices and S and P 500 returns wicking GARCH model Univariate regime wolking GARCH model Results show, that when there are significant fluctuations in oil prices, the resultant unexpected asymmetric pluctuations. Choi and Hammoudeh (2010) The US Symmetric pluctuations Symmetric Results show increasing correlations among Brent DCC-GARCH model Filis et al. (2011) Time-varying correlation between stock market prices and oil prices for oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting Countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil) Contemporaneous correlation analysis Results show increasing correlation increases positively (negatively) in respond to importing and oil-exporting coonomics, the correlation increases positively (negatively) in respond to importing and oil-exporting countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil) Masih et al. (2011) South Korea VEC model VAR-GARCH Multivariate GARCH models VeC model Negative impact of oil price volatility on real stock returns Arouri et al. (2012) Volatility spillovers between oil and stock markets in Europe and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and equity market returns, but stock price volatility to areal significant volatility significant mered significant volatility significant volatility significant mered significant price volatility to areal sisofund the US S and P 5000 VAR-GARCH approach				States
Chiou (2011)prices and S and P 500 returnsswitching GARCH modelin 01 prices, the resolution tunexpected asymmetric price changes lead to negative impacts on S and P 500 returns, but the result does not hold in a regime of lower oil price fluctuationsChoi and Harmoudeh (2010)The USSymmetricResults show increasing correlation among Brent DCC-GARCH modelMolt Will will will will were any correlation and ysisResults show increasing correlation does not differ for 01-importing (US, Gennany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting Countries (Canada, Mexico and Brzil)Contemporaneous correlation analysisResults show that time-varying correlation does not differ for 01-importing (US, Gennany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting Countries (Canada, Mexico and Brzil)Contemporaneous correlation analysisResults show that time-varying correlation results show that oil price shocks, arising from global business cycle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that oil price shocks, arising throm global business cycle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that oil price shave a negative effect in all stock markets in Saudi ArabiaMash et al. (2011)South KoreaVAR-GARCH modelNegative mpact oil price volatility spillovers between oil aproach modelsArouri et al. (2012)Wold tilly spillovers between oil and stock markets in Europe and stock markets in Europe and stock markets of the cold price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of Thailand the Stock Exchange of Thailand the Stock market soft the coldman Sach's Energy Index and the Stock market soft the coldman Sach's Energy Index and the Stock market returns, Sonth Kerea coldman Sach's Energy Index and the Stock Retu	Lee and	Relationship between WTI oil	Univariate regime	Results show, that when there are significant fluctuations
Choi and Hammoudeh (2010)The USwodelchanges lead to negative impacts on S and P 500 returns, but the result does not hold in a regime of lower oil price fluctuations nessults show increasing correlations among Brent DCC-GARCH modelFilis et al. (2011)Time-varying correlation between stock market prices and oil prices for 0i-importing (US, Germany and Nethraftads) and oil-exporting Countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)Contemporaneous correlation mathysisResults show increasing correlation does not differ for 0i-importing uot oil-exporting correlation swith the S and P 500 indexMasih et al. (2011)South KoreaVEC modelWere market in free same stock returnsMasih et al. (2011)South KoreaVEC modelVaR-GARCH Multivariate GARCH modelsJouini (2013)World oil price and stock sectors in Saudi Arabia stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companiesVAR-GARCH approachValatifity transmission between oil price and sectors is foundArouri et al. (2012)Impact of oil price uncertainty on and stock markets in Europe and stock markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy IndexVAR-GARCH approachSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price volatility oner al stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companiesOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between oil and stock returns of 10 worldwide oil to companiesA bivariate GARCH approachSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sector si foundOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and foundaming to oil brice volatility on a stock returns and sach Sach Sprety Index and	Chiou (2011)	prices and S and P 500 returns	switching GARCH	in oil prices, the resultant unexpected asymmetric price
Choi and Harmoudeh (2010)The USSymmetric DCC-GARCH modelNet the result does not hold in a regime of lower oil price fluctuationsFilis et al. (2011)Time-varying correlation between to correlation between or ol-importing CUS, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting Counters (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)Contemporaneous correlation analysisResults show that the S and P 500 index correlation and P 500 index correlation increases positively (negatively) in respont differ for oil-importing and oil-exporting conomies, the correlation increases positively (negatively) in respont demand-side (precautionary demand) oil price shokes a negative effect in all stock markets nad Netherlands) and oil-exporting countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)VEC modelNegative impact of oil price shokes a negative effect in all stock markets negative impact of oil price volatility on results show that oil prices have a negative effect in all stock markets nad Arabia proach maproach maproach maproach maproach maproachVAR-GARCH wascia and stock markets in Europe approach modelsVar-GARCH wascia and stock returns of 10 worldwide oil compariesJranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of Thailand the Stock Exchange of Thailand the Stock Stock return A positive transmission between oil apprice and stock market is Europe and stock markets in Europe and stock market is found the Stock Exchange of Thailand the Stock Exchange of Thailand the Stock Stock harket returnsA bivariate GARCH model, pairwise Granger causality transmission between oil apprice and stock market is found and stock market returns is found the Stock Stock frequency index and the Stock Exchange of Thailan			model	changes lead to negative impacts on S and P 500 returns,
Choi and Hammoudeh (2010)The USSymmetric DCC-GARCH modelResults show increasing correlations among Brent Results show increasing correlations among Brent of oil-importing correlation among Brent orrelations with the S and P 500 indexFilis et al. (2011)Time-varying correlation between stock market prices and oil prices for oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting Countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)Contemporaneous correlation analysisResults show that time-varying correlation does not differ for oil-importing and oil-exporting economies, the correlation analysisMasih et al. (2011)South KoreaVEC modelNegative impact of oil price volatility on real stock returnsJouini (2013)World oil price and stock sectors in Saudi Arabia do to imports to futures returns and stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companiesVAR-GARCH approach approach and stock markets in Europe and stock markets in Europe and stock markets in Europe and stock markets in Europe and stock markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Significant volatility spillovers between oil and approach approachSignificant volatility spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatility of energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility of energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility of an oil price and statistically significant impact is found and stock market returns; Structural VAR-GARCH and fultivariate DEKK modelSignificant impact is found adversely affect real stock market returns, found adversely affect real stock market returns increase an approach adversely affect real stock market return				but the result does not hold in a regime of lower oil price
Choi and Hammoudeh (2010)The USSymmetric DCC-GARCH modelResults show increasing correlations among Brent oil, WTI oil, copper, gold and silver but decreasing correlations with the S and P 500 index Results show that there-varying correlation does not differ for oil-importing and oil-exporting coultines (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)Contemporaneous correlation analysisContemporaneous correlation increases positively (negatively) in respond to important agregate demand-side (precautionary demand) oil price shocks arising from global business corelation increases positively (negatively) in respond to important agregate demand-side (precautionary demand) oil price shocks. Lagged correlation results show that oil prices have a negative effect in all stock markets ingrices have a negative effect ingrice and stock returnsJouini (2013)World oil price and stock sectors in Saudi Arabia in Saudi Arabia and stock markets in Europe and stock markets in EuropeVAR-GARCH model, pairwise approach approachVolatility transmission between oil price and sector stock returns are found. Observed spillover effect scome entirely from spillowers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatility transmission terturn, but stock reagtive effect real stock market return, but stock reagtive effect real stock market return, b				fluctuations
Hammoudeh (2010)DCC-GARCH modeloil, WTI oil, copper, gol and silver but decreasing correlation switch market prices and oil prices for oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting Countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)DCC-GARCH modeloil, WTI oil, copper, gol and silver but decreasing correlation with the S and P 500 index differ for oil-importing and oil-exporting economies, the correlation increases positively (negatively) in respond to important aggregate demand-side (precautionary demand) oil prices shocks, arising from global business excle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that oil prices shocks, arising from global business excle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that oil prices shocks, arising from global business excle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that oil prices shocks, arising from global business excle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that oil prices shocks, arising from global business approachMasih et al. (2017)South KoreaVAR-GARCH approachVolatility transmission between oil price and stock sectors is found Multivariate GARCH modelsVolatility spillover effectArouri et al. (2012)Wolatility spillovers between oil and stock markets in Europe and stock markets in EuropeVAR-GARCH approachSignificant volatility spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatility transmission trunn, but stock franger causility testsJiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of Thailand Goldman Sach's Energy Index, and the US S and P 500A bivariate GARCH modelSignificant volatility gluer effect subs with two S and P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility of the energ	Choi and	The US	Symmetric	Results show increasing correlations among Brent
Filis et al. (2011)Time-varying correlation between stock market prices and oil prices for oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting Contemporaneous correlation analysisContemporaneous correlation analysisMasih et al. (2011)South KoreaContemporaneous correlation analysisContemporaneous correlation increases positively (negatively) in respond to importing ado die-xporting contricts (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)Masih et al. (2011)South KoreaVEC modelNet Contemporaneous correlation increases positively (negatively) in respond to importing agregate demand-side (precautionary demand) oil prices shocks, arising from global business cycle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that oil price short on the determinary demand oil price shocks, arising from real stock returnsJouini (2013)World oil price and stock sectors in Saudi ArabiaVAR-GARCH approachValatility transmission between oil price and stock returns are found. Observed spillover effect some entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatilitits are all insginificant results show that movement in real oil price does not and stock market si neurope and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and te US S and P 500 the US S and P 500<	Hammoudeh (2010)		DCC-GARCH model	oil WTL oil copper gold and silver but decreasing
Filis et al. (2011) Time-varying correlation between stock market prices and oil prices shocks, arising from global business for oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting connomies, the correlation narcases positively (negatively) in respond to important aggregate demand.side (precautionary demand) oil prices hocks, arising from global business cycle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation fue to all "prices hocks, arising from global business cycle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation necases positively (negatively) in respond to important aggregate demand.side (precautionary demand) oil prices hocks, arising from global business cycle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation study show that time-varying correlation does not differ for oil-importing economies, the correlation necesses positively (negatively) in respond to important aggregate demand.side (precautionary demand) oil prices hocks, arising from global business cycle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that oil price shocks, arising from global business cycle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that intervarying correlation does not differ for oil-incestants and stock returns for ond price does not adversely affect real stock return. A positive enter for or opsitive and significant model, privates of the correlation algerigension adversely affect real stock return. B roboks, and that spillovers of volatility does affect real stock return. A positive conductive demand and oil price incesse only what the own and significant impact is found analysis Alternational price and equity markets of the correlation algerigension adversely affect real stock returns. A positive correlation algerigensin and volatility and volatility and volatility and volatility and	fiuminouden (2010)		Dee officer model	correlations with the S and P 500 index
Answer and (corr)Thise tan (corr)Thise tan (corr)Thise tan (corr)Thise tan (corr)stock market prices and oil prices for oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting Countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)correlation analysisdiffer for oil-importing and oil-exporting conomies, the correlation increases positively (negatively) in respond to important aggregate demand-side (precautionary demand) oil price shocks, arising from global business eycle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that to important aggregate demand-side (precautionary demand) oil price shocks, arising from global business eycle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that to important aggregate demand-side (precautionary demand) oil price shocks, arising from global business eycle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that notel, approach modelsMasih et al. (2012)World oil price and stock sectors in Saudi ArabiaVAR-GARCH approach approachNativariate GARCH approach approachSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sectors is found. A bivariate GARCH approachSignificant volatility spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatility transmission terum, but stock returnsJiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of Thailand Goldman Sach's Energy Index and to US sand P 500VAR-GARCH transmission between oil and took modelSignificant volatility tansmission running from oil took substantial increases in the volatility spill-over and interdependence between oil and the two stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011VAR-GARCH VAR-GARCH VAR-GARCH VAR-GARCH transmission between oil and tool liptice chang	Filis et al. (2011)	Time-varying correlation between	Contemporaneous	Results show that time-varying correlation does not
and with many matrixand with pricescontraction many of pricesfor oil-importing (US, Germany and Netherlands) and oil-exporting Countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)correlation increase positively (negatively) in respond to importan aggregate demand-side (precautionary demand) oil price shocks, arising from global business expel's fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that oil prices have a negative effect in all stock markets Negative impact of oil price and stock sectors is foundMasih et al. (2011)South KoreaVEC modelNegative impact of oil price and stock approach approach sectors is foundNegative impact of oil price and stock sectors is foundOhang et al. (2009)Wold oil price and stock sectors in Saudi Arabia stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companiesVAR-GARCH approach approachSignificant volatility spillovers between oil asector stock returns are found. Observed spillover effects come entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatilities are all insignificant adversely affect real stock return. A positive one-driectional volatility of the energy and equity markets of the Goldman sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500NAR-GARCH Multivariate BEKK modelSignificant volatility of the energy and equity markets of the Goldman sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500NAR-GARCH Multivariate BEKK modelSignificant volatility of the energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility to an significant impact is foundOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500VAR-GARCH VAR-GARCH VAR-GARCH <br< td=""><td>1 mb et ul. (2011)</td><td>stock market prices and oil prices</td><td>correlation analysis</td><td>differ for oil-importing and oil-exporting economies the</td></br<>	1 mb et ul. (2011)	stock market prices and oil prices	correlation analysis	differ for oil-importing and oil-exporting economies the
In the information increases positively (unsequence)and Netherlands) and oil-exporting Countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)Contries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)Contries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)Contries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)Masih et al. (2011)South KoreaVEC modelNegative inpact of oil price volatility on real stock returnsJouini (2013)World oil price and stock sectors in Saudi ArabiaVAR-GARCH approachNegative impact of oil price and stock sectors is foundJouini (2013)World oil price and stock sectors in Saudi ArabiaVAR-GARCH approachResults show no volatility spillover and stock sectors is foundChang et al. (2009)Volatility spillovers between ompaniesWultivariate GARCH approachSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sector stock returns are found. Observed spillover effects come entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of shocks and P solutility approachJiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of Thailand but BS and P 500A bivariate GARCH modelSignificant volatility approach adversely affect real stock return. Ap ositive one-directional volatility the volatility of the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Netwer of and toxe there model<		for oil importing (US, Cormony	correlation analysis	arrelation increases positively (negatively) in respond
and returnances and returns and sock sectors is foundto in price shocks, arising from global businessMasih et al. (2011)South KoreaVEC modelNegative impact of oil price volatility on real stock returnsJouini (2013)World oil price and stock sectorsVAR-GARCHNegative impact of oil price and stock returnsJouini (2013)World oil price and stock sectorsVAR-GARCHSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and stock returns and stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companiesCharg et al. (2012)Volatility spillovers between oil and stock markets in EuropeVAR-GARCHSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and stock returns are found. Observed spilloverArouri et al. (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of ThailandA bivariate GARCHSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price does not the Stock Exchange of ThailandA bivariate GARCHOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKKResults show that low S and P 500 returns causeIrin et al. (2014)Negative and stock market returnsDC-GARCHSituational aggregate demand-side (precutulonary stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global coromy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply receles and and		and Natherlands) and all superting		to important appropriate demond side (measure) in respond
Countries (Countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)Countries (Canada, Mexico and Brazil)demand 0) of price shocks, arising from global business cycle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that oil prices have a negative effect in all stock marketsMasih et al. (2011)South KoreaVEC modelNegative inpact of oil price volatility on real stock returnsJouini (2013)World oil price and stock sectors in Saudi Arabia modelsVAR-GARCH approach modelsVolatility ransmission between oil price and stock sectors is found Results show no volatility spillovers between oblatility spillovers between oil and stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companiesSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sectors is found Results show that movement in real oil price does not adversely affect real stock market return. A positive one-directional volatility dees affect real stock returns. A positive one-directional volatility dees affect real stock return. A positive cone-directional volatility dates for the stock returns cause adversely affect real stock return. A positive one-directional volatility dates affect real stock returns. A positive one-directional volatility dates affect real stock return. A positive one-directional volatility dates in Europe and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK Results show that low Sand P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility of the energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility to energy price shocksOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity market returnsVAR-GARCH, Wultivariate BEKK modelSubstantial increases in the volatility spill-over and vector		and Netherlands) and oll-exporting		to important aggregate demand-side (precautionary
Brazil)cycle fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that oil prices have a negative effect in all stock markets Negative impact of oil price volatility on real stock returnsMasih et al. (2013)World oil price and stock sectors in Saudi Arabia Uotatility spillovers betweenVAR-GARCH Multivariate GARCH modelNegative impact of oil price volatility on real stock sectors is foundChang et al. (2009)Volatility spillovers between stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companiesVAR-GARCH modelSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sector stock returns or 10 worldwide oil companiesSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sector stock returns are found. Observed spillover effects come entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatility affect real stock return. A positive draresely affect real stock market return, but stock frager causalityJiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of Thailand differ real stock return for and positive dolama Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelResults show that low S and P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility off the energy sol volatility and volatility VAR-GARCH, VAR-GARCH, Existence of positive and significant volatility spill-over transmission between oil and the US S and P 500Lin et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500VAR-GARCH, transmission between oil and VAR-GARCH, VAR-GARCH,Basher and Sadorsky (2006)Impact of oil price changes on a set fol price shocks impact on s		Countries (Canada, Mexico and		demand) oil price shocks, arising from global business
Masih et al. (2011)South KoreaVEC modelNegative impact of oil price volatility on real stock returnsJouini (2013)World oil price and stock sectorsVAR-GARCHValtility transmission between oil price and stock sectors in Saudi ArabiaChang et al. (2009)Volatility spillovers betweenMultivariate GARCHMultivariate GARCHWTT crude-oil futures returns and stock markets in EuropemodelsSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and stock sectors is foundArouri et al. (2012)Volatility spillovers between oil and stock markets in EuropeVAR-GARCHSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sector stock returns are found. Observed spilloverJiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of ThailandA bivariate GARCHSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price des not adversely affect real stock market returns, but stockOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKKLin et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKKBasher and Sadors (2014)Impact of oil price changes on a set Sadorsky (2006)OPC-GARCH,Existence of positive and significant volatility spill-over and significant volatility spill-overBasher and Sadorsky (2006)of 21 emerging stock market returns, stoundPooled regressionA storng and statistically significant impact is foundBasher and Sadorsky (2006)Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns stout Are treums, South Africa, 1973-2011Str		Brazil)		cycle's fluctuations. Lagged correlation results show that
Mash et al. (2011) South Korea VEC model Negative impact of oil price volatility on real stock returns Jouini (2013) World oil price and stock sectors in Saudi Arabia approach sectors is found Chang et al. (2009) Volatility spillovers between oil price and stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companies Wiltivariate GARCH Significant volatility spillovers between oil price and stock returns are found. Observed spillover Arouri et al. (2012) Volatility spillovers between oil and stock markets in Europe VAR-GARCH Significant volatility spillovers between oil price and sector stock returns are found. Observed spillover Jiranyakul (2014) Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of Thailand A bivariate GARCH Results show that movement in real oil price does not adversely affect real stock return. A positive tests Olson et al. (2014) Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500 Multivariate BEKK Results show that low S and P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility spill-over transmission between oil and the US S and P 500 Lin et al. (2014) Dynamic volatility and volatility VAR-GARCH, VAR-GARCH, VAR-GARCH, Significant volatility to energy price shocks Basher and Sacky 2006) Oil price changes on a set Sacorsky (2006) Of 21 emerging stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011 VAR-GARCH, approach Basher and Sacky 2011 Oli price shocks impact on stock market retururus, South Africa, 1973-				oil prices have a negative effect in all stock markets
Jouini (2013) World oil price and stock sectors in Saudi Arabia approach sectors is found Chang et al. (2009) Volatility spillovers between Multivariate GARCH Wolatility transmission between oil price and stock sectors is found WTI crude-oil futures returns and stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companies Arouri et al. (2012) Volatility spillovers between oil and stock markets in Europe approach sector stock returns are found. Observed spillover effect scome entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatility spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatilities are all insignificant Jiranyakul (2014) Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of Thailand fue Stock Exchange of Thailand Olson et al. (2014) Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500 Lin et al. (2014) Impact of oil price volatility and volatility and volatility and volatility and volatility and volatility and volatility of the energy index and the US S and P 500 Lin et al. (2014) Relationship between the energy Sadorship Construction and the US S and P 500 Lin et al. (2014) Impact of oil price knerket returns is found for anian stock market returns is found the us stock market returns is found for anian stock market returns on and the US S and P 500 Lin et al. (2014) Impact of oil price changes on a set Sadorsky (2006) of 21 emerging stock market returns is found Ghanaian stock market returns is found analysis Gupta and Modise Oil price shocks impact on stock analysis (2013) of 21 emerging stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011 Sadorsky (2006) of 21 emerging stock market returns (2014) Proventing country stock returns is found analysis (2013) of 21 emerging stock market returns (2014) of 21 emerging stock market retures of the constock market retures is found analys	Masih et al. (2011)	South Korea	VEC model	Negative impact of oil price volatility on real stock
Journi (2013)World oil price and stock sectors in Saudi Arabia wolatility spillovers between WTI crude-oil futures returns and stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companiesVAR-GARCH approach modelsvolatility spillovers between oil price and stock sectors is found Results show no volatility spillover effectArouri et al. (2012)Volatility spillovers between oil and stock markets in EuropeVAR-GARCH approachSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sector stock returns are found. Observed spillover effects come entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatilities are all insignificantJiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of ThailandA bivariate GARCH model, pairwise testsResults show that movement in real oil price does not adversely affect real stock market return, but stock Granger causality testsOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelResults show that low S and P 500 stock market returnsLin et al. (2014)Dynamic volatility otalitity transmission between oil and dhaaian stock market returnsVAR-GARCH, VAR-GARCH, VAR-GARCHExistence of positive and significant volatility spill-over and interdependence between oil and the two stock analysisBasher and Gupta and Modise (2013)Oil price changes on a set of 21 emerging stock market returns (2014)Pooled regression analysisGupta and Modise (2013)Oil price changes on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR aproachFor oil-importing	(0010)			returns
in Saudi Arabiaapproachsectors is foundChang et al. (2009)Volatility spillovers betweenMultivariate GARCHResults show no volatility spillover effectArouri et al. (2012)Volatility spillovers between oil and stock markets in EuropeVAR-GARCHSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sector stock returns are found. Observed spillover effects come entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatilities are all insignificantJiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of ThailandA bivariate GARCH model, pairwise Granger causality testsSignificant volatility does affect real stock return, but stock Granger causality testsOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelResults show that low S and P 500 returns cause turns causeLin et al. (2014)Impact of oil price changes on a set Sadorsky (2006) of 21 emerging stock market returns Sadorsky (2006)VAR-GARCH, market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011VAR-GARCH, market returns with VAR- AGARCH and por colatility and volatility to an interdependence between oil and the two stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011	Jouini (2013)	World oil price and stock sectors	VAR-GARCH	Volatility transmission between oil price and stock
Chang et al. (2009)Volatility spillovers between WTI crude-oil futures returns and stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companiesMultivariate GARCH modelsResults show no volatility spillover effectArouri et al. (2012)Volatility spillovers between oil and stock markets in EuropeVAR-GARCH approachSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sector stock returns are found. Observed spillover effects come entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatilities are all insignificantJiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of ThailandA bivariate GARCH model, pairwise Granger causality testsResults show that movement in real oil price does not adversely affect real stock return. A positive one-directional volatility transmission running from oil to stock market is foundOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelResults show that low S and P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility of the energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility to energy price shocksLin et al. (2014)Impact of oil price changes on a set Sadorsky (2006)VAR-GARCH, of 21 emerging stock market returns and wolatility and for oil price on ange on a set Sadorsky (2006)VAR-GARCH, of 21 emerging stock market returns, south Africa, 1973-2011VAR-GARCH, occe and ector and statistically significant impact is found and statistically significant impact is found analysis		in Saudi Arabia	approach	sectors is found
WTI crude-oil futures returns and stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companiesmodelsArouri et al. (2012)Volatility spillovers between oil and stock markets in EuropeVAR-GARCH approachSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sector stock returns are found. Observed spillover effects come entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatilities are all insignificantJiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of ThailandA bivariate GARCH model, pairwise Granger causality testsResults show that movement in real oil price does not adversely affect real stock market return. A positive one-directional volatility does affect real stock return. A positive testsOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelResults show that low S and P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility of the energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility to energy price shocksLin et al. (2014)Impact of oil price changes on a set Sadorsky (2006)VAR-GARCH, Of 1 energing stock market returns analysisVAR-GARCH, analysisBasher and Sudorsky (2006)Impact of oil price on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011VAR-GARCH approachFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply is rising.	Chang et al. (2009)	Volatility spillovers between	Multivariate GARCH	Results show no volatility spillover effect
Arouri et al. (2012)stock returns of 10 worldwide oil companiesVAR-GARCH approachSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sector stock returns are found. Observed spillover effects come entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatilities are all insignificantJiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of ThailandA bivariate GARCH model, pairwise Granger causality testsSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price does not adversely affect real stock market return, but stock price volatility does affect real stock return. A positive one-directional volatility transmission running from oil to stock market is foundOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelResults show that low S and P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility of the energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility to energy price shocksLin et al. (2014)Impact of oil price changes on a set of 21 emerging stock market returns and volatilityVAR-GARCH, VAR-AGARCH and analysisExistence of positive and significant volatility spill-over and interdependence between oil and the two stock market returns is foundGupta and Modise (2013)Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR approachFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply visiong. In case of speculative demand is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply<		WTI crude-oil futures returns and	models	
Arouri et al. (2012)companies Volatility spillovers between oil and stock markets in EuropeVAR-GARCH approachSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sector stock returns are found. Observed spillover effects come entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatilities are all insignificantJiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of ThailandA bivariate GARCH model, pairwiseResults show that movement in real oil price does not adversely affect real stock market return, but stock one-directional volatility does affect real stock return. A positive testsOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelResults show that low S and P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility of the energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility on volatility and volatility transmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returns Basher and Sadorsky (2006)VAR-GARCH, VAR-GARCH, VAR-AGARCH and Impact of oil price changes on a set of 21 emerging stock market returns South Africa, 1973-2011Other energy stock market returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply <br< td=""><td></td><td>stock returns of 10 worldwide oil</td><td></td><td></td></br<>		stock returns of 10 worldwide oil		
Arouri et al. (2012)Volatility spillovers between oil and stock markets in EuropeVAR-GARCH approachSignificant volatility spillovers between oil price and sector stock returns are found. Observed spillover effects come entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatilities are all insignificantJiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of ThailandA bivariate GARCH model, pairwise Granger causality testsA bivariate GARCH model, pairwise Granger causality testsResults show that movement in real oil price does not adversely affect real stock market return, but stock price volatility does affect real stock return. A positive one-directional volatility transmission running from oil to stock market is foundOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelSubstantial increases in the volatility of the energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility to energy price shocksLin et al. (2014)Impact of oil price changes on a set of 21 emerging stock market returns Sadorsky (2006)VAR-GARCH, Pooled regression analysisVAR-GARCH and statistically significant impact is found analysisGupta and Modise (2013)Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR approachFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply whence deal result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil suppl		companies		
and stock markets in Europeapproachsector stock returns are found. Observed spillover effects come entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatilities are all insignificantJiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of ThailandA bivariate GARCH model, pairwise Granger causality testsResults show that movement in real oil price does not adversely affect real stock return. A positive one-directional volatility does affect real stock return. A positive testsOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelResults show that low S and P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility of the energy price soubtaility to energy price shocksLin et al. (2014)Dynamic volatility and colutility and volatility transmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returnsVAR-GARCH, DCC-GARCHExistence of positive and significant volatility spill-over tavistically significant impact is foundBasher and Sadorsky (2006)Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR approachFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply action of a long price shocks	Arouri et al. (2012)	Volatility spillovers between oil	VAR-GARCH	Significant volatility spillovers between oil price and
Jiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of ThailandA bivariate GARCH model, pairwise Granger causality testseffects come entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that spillovers of volatilities are all insignificant Results show that movement in real oil price does not adversely affect real stock market return, but stock Granger causality testsOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelResults show that low S and P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility of the energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility to energy price shocksLin et al. (2014)Dynamic volatility of oil price changes on a set Sadorsky (2006)VAR-GARCH, OIl price shocks impact on stock market returnsVAR-AGARCH and analysisExistence of positive and significant volatility spill-over and statistically significant impact is found analysisBasher and Sulti and Modise (2013)Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR approachFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply choole.		and stock markets in Europe	approach	sector stock returns are found. Observed spillover
Jiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of ThailandA bivariate GARCH model, pairwise Granger causality testsspillovers of volatilities are all insignificant Results show that movement in real oil price does not adversely affect real stock market return, but stock price volatility does affect real stock return. A positive one-directional volatility transmission running from oil to stock market is foundOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelResults show that low S and P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility of the energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility to energy price shocksLin et al. (2014)Dynamic volatility and volatility transmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returnsVAR-GARCH, Pooled regression analysisExistence of positive and significant volatility spill-over and interdependence between oil and the two stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR approachFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply is rising.				effects come entirely from spillovers of shocks, and that
Jiranyakul (2014)Impact of oil price uncertainty on the Stock Exchange of ThailandA bivariate GARCH model, pairwise Granger causality testsResults show that movement in real oil price does not adversely affect real stock market return, but stock price volatility does affect real stock return. A positive one-directional volatility transmission running from oil to stock market is foundOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelResults show that low S and P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility of the energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility to energy price shocksLin et al. (2014)Dynamic volatility transmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returnsVAR-GARCH, Pooled regression analysisVAR-AGARCH and DCC-GARCHmarket returns is foundBasher and Sadorsky (2006)Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR approachFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply vis reak reture dealing.				spillovers of volatilities are all insignificant
the Stock Exchange of Thailandmodel, pairwiseadversely affect real stock market return, but stockOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelResults show that low S and P 500 returns causeLin et al. (2014)Dynamic volatility and volatility transmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returnsVAR-GARCH, VAR-GARCH and analysisExistence of positive and significant volatility spill-over and interdependence between oil and the two stock market returns is foundBasher and Sadorsky (2006)Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR anzket returns (2013)For oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply arboine.	Jiranyakul (2014)	Impact of oil price uncertainty on	A bivariate GARCH	Results show that movement in real oil price does not
Granger causality testsprice volatility does affect real stock return. A positive one-directional volatility transmission running from oil to stock market is foundOlson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelResults show that low S and P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility of the energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility to energy price shocksLin et al. (2014)Dynamic volatility and volatility transmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returnsVAR-GARCH, DCC-GARCHExistence of positive and significant volatility spill-over and interdependence between oil and the two stock DCC-GARCHBasher and Sadorsky (2006)Oil price changes on a set of 21 emerging stock market returns (2013)Pooled regression analysisA strong and statistically significant impact is found analysisGupta and Modise (2013)Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR aproachFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply chacker activer dealing		the Stock Exchange of Thailand	model, pairwise	adversely affect real stock market return, but stock
Olson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelResults show that low S and P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility of the energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility to energy price shocksLin et al. (2014)Dynamic volatility transmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returnsVAR-GARCH, VAR-AGARCH and DCC-GARCHExistence of positive and significant volatility spill-over and interdependence between oil and the two stock market returns is foundBasher and Sadorsky (2006)Oil price changes on a set of 21 emerging stock market returnsPooled regression analysisA strong and statistically significant impact is found analysisGupta and Modise (2013)Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR approachFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply shocks_ stock			Granger causality	price volatility does affect real stock return. A positive
Olson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelstock market is found Results show that low S and P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility of the energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility to energy price shocksLin et al. (2014)Dynamic volatility and volatility transmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returnsVAR-GARCH, VAR-AGARCH and DCC-GARCHExistence of positive and significant volatility spill-over and interdependence between oil and the two stock market returns is foundBasher and Sadorsky (2006)Impact of oil price changes on a set of 21 emerging stock market returnsPooled regression analysisA strong and statistically significant impact is found analysisGupta and Modise (2013)Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR approachFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply shocks			tests	one-directional volatility transmission running from oil to
Olson et al. (2014)Relationship between the energy and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500Multivariate BEKK modelResults show that low S and P 500 returns cause substantial increases in the volatility of the energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility to energy price shocksLin et al. (2014)Dynamic volatility and volatility transmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returnsVAR-GARCH, VAR-AGARCH and DCC-GARCHExistence of positive and significant volatility spill-over and interdependence between oil and the two stock market returns is foundBasher and Sadorsky (2006)Oil price changes on a set of 21 emerging stock market returnsPooled regression analysisA strong and statistically significant impact is found analysisGupta and Modise (2013)Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR approachFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply chocks				stock market is found
and equity markets of the Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500modelsubstantial increases in the volatility of the energy index; however, they find only a weak response from S and P 500 volatility to energy price shocksLin et al. (2014)Dynamic volatility and volatility transmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returnsVAR-GARCH, VAR-AGARCH and DCC-GARCHExistence of positive and significant volatility spill-over and interdependence between oil and the two stock market returns is foundBasher and Sadorsky (2006)Impact of oil price changes on a set of 21 emerging stock market returnsPooled regression analysisA strong and statistically significant impact is found analysisGupta and Modise (2013)Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR approachFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply shoelen_stative_factures_dealing	Olson et al. (2014)	Relationship between the energy	Multivariate BEKK	Results show that low S and P 500 returns cause
Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500 Lin et al. (2014) Basher and Sadorsky (2006) Gupta and Modise (2013) Gupta and Modise (2013) Goldman Sach's Energy Index and the US S and P 500 Dynamic volatility transmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returns Gupta and Modise (2013) Gupta And Modise (201	()	and equity markets of the	model	substantial increases in the volatility of the energy index:
Lin et al. (2014) Basher and Sadorsky (2006) Gupta and Modise (2013) Lin et al. (2014) Lin et al. (2014) Lin et al. (2014) Lin et al. (2014) Lin et al. (2014) Dynamic volatility transmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returns Gupta and Modise (2013) Coll price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011 Lin et al. (2014) Lin et al. (2014) Dynamic volatility transmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returns Gupta and Modise (2013) Lin et al. (2014) Lin et al. (2014) Dynamic volatility transmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returns Gupta and Modise (2013) Lin et al. (2014) Lin et al. (2014) Lin et al. (2014) Dynamic volatility transmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returns Gupta and Modise (2013) Lin et al. (2014) Lin et al. (2014) Dynamic volatility VAR-GARCH and DCC-GARCH analysis Structural VAR approach Lin et al. (2014) Hind only a weak response from 5 and 1 Solution S a		Goldman Sach's Energy Index and		however they find only a weak response from S and P
Lin et al. (2014)Dynamic volatility uransmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returnsVAR-GARCH, VAR-AGARCH and DCC-GARCHExistence of positive and significant volatility spill-over and interdependence between oil and the two stock market returns is foundBasher and Sadorsky (2006)Impact of oil price changes on a set of 21 emerging stock market returnsPooled regression analysisA strong and statistically significant impact is foundGupta and Modise (2013)Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR approachFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply shoeles		the US S and P 500		500 volatility to energy price shocks
Dimercult (SOTT)Dynamic fortality and volumityFirst officitiestransmission between oil and Ghanaian stock market returnsVAR-AGARCH and DCC-GARCHand interdependence between oil and the two stock market returns is foundBasher and Sadorsky (2006)Impact of oil price changes on a set of 21 emerging stock market returnsPooled regression analysisA strong and statistically significant impact is foundGupta and Modise (2013)Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR approachFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply shoele _ stock returns dealing	Lin et al. (2014)	Dynamic volatility and volatility	VAR-GARCH	Existence of positive and significant volatility spill-over
Hansmission between on andFriends (Friends (Friends))Ghanaian stock market returnsDCC-GARCHBasher andImpact of oil price changes on a setSadorsky (2006)of 21 emerging stock market returnsGupta and ModiseOil price shocks impact on stock(2013)Oil price shocks impact on stock1973-2011structural VARFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply shoele actack returns dealing	2	transmission between oil and	VAR-AGARCH and	and interdenendence between oil and the two stock
Basher and Sadorsky (2006)Impact of oil price changes on a set of 21 emerging stock market returnsPooled regression analysisA strong and statistically significant impact is foundGupta and Modise (2013)Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011Structural VAR approachFor oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply shoele stock returns dealing		Ghanajan stock market returns		market returns is found
Basher and Impact of on pitce changes on a set sadorsky (2006) Product regression of 21 emerging stock market returns Product regression analysis Gupta and Modise (2013) Oil price shocks impact on stock market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011 Structural VAR approach For oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply shocks	Pachar and	Impact of oil price changes on a set	Dect-OARCH Booled regression	A strong and statistically significant impact is found
Gupta and Modise Oil price shocks impact on stock Structural VAR (2013) market returns, South Africa, approach 1973-2011 result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply shocks at active stock returns dealing.	Sadorsky (2006)	of 21 emerging stock market returns	analysis	r strong and statistically significant inipact is found
(2013) On price snocks impact on stock structural VAR approach For oil-importing country stock returns increase as a result of an oil price increase only when global economy is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply shocks at active stock returns dealing.	Cupto or 1 Mr. 1	Oil price checks interest and the	analysis Structure 1 VA D	For all importing country at all rations in an
(2013) market returns, South Africa, 1973-2011 approach is rising. In case of speculative demand and oil supply shoelds a stock returns dealing.	(2012)	on price snocks impact on stock	Suuciural VAK	rout of on oil price increase only when slobel economic
19/5-2011 Is rising. In case of speculative demand and off supply shoelds a stock returns dealing.	(2013)	1072 2011	approach	is rising. In ansa of spoulative demand and ail surgly
$\mathbf{x}_{111}\mathbf{y}_{112}\mathbf{y}_{21} = \mathbf{x}_{111}\mathbf{y}_{121}$		1715-2011		shocks – stock returns decline

Table 1: Summary of relevant literature sources

VAR-GARCH: Vector autoregressive generalized autoregressive conditional heteroskedasticity, DCC: Dynamic conditional correlation

identified relationship between variables is undefined enough. Thus, some researchers have come to the conclusion that the connection exists, others come to the conclusion that the causal link is missing. Fourthly, quite a few studies are devoted to the analysis of the symmetry of the reaction of the stock market to positive and negative shocks of uncertainty in oil prices, including the example of Russia, which also reinforces the relevance and necessity of this research. In this regard, we apply a general bivariate framework in which a VAR is modified to accommodate GARCH-in-mean errors, thus avoiding the generated regressor problem, by simultaneously estimating all the parameters by the full information maximum likelihood following Elder (1995; 2004) and Elder and Serletis (2010).

3. MATERIALS AND METHODS

To achieve the objectives in this study we use a model developed by Elder (1995; 2004) and used in Elder and Serletis (2010). This model is a model of bivariate month growth stock market (in market prices) and the rise in oil prices. The model is based on a structural VAR modified to account for conditional heteroscedasticity in parametric form bivariate GARCH-in-mean. The working assumption is that the dynamics of the structural system can be summarized by a linear function of the variables of the sample and terms related to the conditional variance, which can be represented as follows:

$$Ay_t = K + \Gamma_1 y_{t-1} + \Gamma_2 y_{t-2} + \ldots + \Gamma_n y_{t-p} + (\Omega M) \sqrt{H_t} + \varepsilon_t$$
(1)

Where dim (A)=Dim(Γ_1) are $p \times p$ matrices, $\sqrt{H_t}$ is a diagonal and Ω (*M*) is a matrix polynomial in the lag operator. y_t is a vector containing real oil price and real stock price growth rates (returns), $\varepsilon_t | |\Pi_{t-1} \sim \text{iid} (0, H_t)$ represents uncorrelated structural disturbances in the system where Π_{t-1} is the available information set at time t-1.

The above specification allows the conditional matrix of standard deviations impact (\sqrt{Ht}) on the conditional mean. For empirical verification of the hypothesis about the impact of the uncertainty of oil prices on stock prices, a test of restrictions on the elements of Ω (*M*) that relate the conditional standard deviation of stock prices, given by the element $\sqrt{H_t}$, to the conditional mean of y_t is performed. In the case that the volatility of oil prices has a negative impact on stock prices, the negative and statistically significant coefficients on the conditional standard deviation of oil in the stock price equation.

The conditional variance H_t is modelled as bivariate GARCH of which a general version is represented in Engle and Kroner (1995) as:

$$h_{t} = C_{v} + \sum_{j=1}^{J} F_{i} vec \left(\varepsilon_{t-j} \varepsilon'_{t-j} \right) + \sum_{i=1}^{I} G_{i} h_{t-i}, \qquad (2)$$

 $\varepsilon_t \sim \sqrt{H_t} z_t; z_t \sim iidN(0, I)$ where C_v is $N^2 \times 1$ matrix, F and G are $N^2 \times N^2$ matrices and $h_t = vec(H_t)$. This specification does not however guarantee that H_t is a positive definite. According to Elder

(2004), when we apply a common identifying assumption in structural VAR, we substantially simplify the variance function, written in terms of the structural disturbances. Under a zero simultaneous correlation of structural disturbances, the conditional variance matrix H_t is diagonal, reducing the requisite number of variance function parameters. By dimensioning the variance function is reduced to the following:

$$diag(H_t) = C_v + \sum_{j=1}^{J} F_i diag(\varepsilon_{t-j}\varepsilon_{t-j}) + \sum_{i=1}^{I} G_i diag(H_{t-i}), \quad (3)$$

Where, *diag* is the operator that extracts the diagonal from a square matrix. The second and third terms of equation (3) represent the ARCH and GARCH terms. Imposing an additional restriction that the conditional variance of $y_{i,t}$ depends only on its own past squared errors and its own conditional variances, the parameter matrices F_j and G_i are also diagonal. The variance function (equation (3)) is then estimated with J = I = 1, which is the specification for a GARCH model (1,1)-in-mean VAR model.

The bivariate GARCH-in-mean VAR model is represented by equations (1) and (3), which are estimated by full information maximum likelihood in order to avoid Pagan's generated regressor problem related to estimating the variance function parameters separately from the conditional mean parameters (Pagan, 1984). The procedure is to maximize the log likelihood with respect to the structural parameters A, K, Γ_1 , Γ_2 , ..., Γ_n , Ω , *F* and *G*, where,

$$l_{t} = -\left(\frac{N}{2}\right) \ln(2\pi) + 1/2\ln|B|^{2} - 1/2\ln|H|_{t} - 1/2(\varepsilon_{t}H_{t}^{-1}) \quad (4)$$

According to Elder and Serletis (2010), pre-sample values of the conditional variances matrix H_0 are determined according to their unconditional expectation and condition on pre-sample values of y. The restrictions, listed below, are imposed to ensure a positive definite and covariance stationary H_i and ε_i . Firstly, C_v is wise-positive. Secondly, *F* are non-negative wise-element. Thirdly, Eigen-values of (*F*+*G*) are less than on in modulus. Given that the conditions of standard regularity hold, full information maximum likelihood gives asymptotically normal and efficient estimates, with the asymptotic covariance due to inverse if the Fisher's matrix. When we introduce usual identifying procedure in vector autocorrection models, we can estimate free terms in *B* subject to a rank condition. To fulfill this requirement, we follow Edelstein and Kilian (2007), as well as Elder and Serletis (2010) – stock returns are able to respond to simultaneous shocks in oil prices.

To test the hypothesis about presence or absence of asymmetry in stock returns to oil price shocks we employ impulse response technique. This method helps in identifying the response of the variable to shocks in explaining variable. Impulse response technique for the GARCH-in-mean VAR is used in the manner of Elder (2003). Confidence intervals are determined according to Monte Carlo method (Hamilton, 1994). Responses to the simulated shocks are derived using maximum likelihood estimates of the model. Base on parameter values drawn randomly from the sampling distribution of the MLEs, confidence intervals are generated by simulating 1000 impulse responses.

Variables	ADF		РР		NP		KPSS	
	Intercept							
		and trend		and trend		and trend		and trend
OilP	-2.53	-3.49	-1.29	-3.45	1.02	-21.22	3.50	0.89
SP	-0.68	-1.98	-0.67	-0.92	2.56	-13.45	4.02	0.93
$\Delta OilP$	-34.12*	-33.29*	-29.74*	-30.09*	-28.40*	-46.68*	0.09	0.13
ΔSP	-63.42*	-45.12*	-46.90*	-34.51*	-123.05*	-123.93*	0.08	0.05

Table 2: Results of unit root testing

*Indicate significance at 5% level and rejection of the null hypothesis. PP: Phillips-Perron, KPSS: Kwiatkowski, Phillips, Schmidt and Shin, ADF: Augmented Dickey Fuller

The study is conducted on the example of Russia. To reflect world oil prices are used, spot prices of crude oil Brent (Europe). Base period is 1 week. The source of information is the statistical database of the US Energy Information Administration. To reflect the uncertainty of oil prices is used the standard deviation of the one step ahead forecast errors, conditional on various information sets. This approach is consistent with proposed in Elder and Serletis (2010).

For data evaluation the market price of Russian shares, we use the average of the weekly composite data of the MICEX Index, denominated in Russian roubles. Data on market value of shares of the largest traded companies, covering the main sectors of the economy, is obtained from the statistical database of the Moscow Exchange.

To conduct the study, it is necessary to determine the stationarity of the used time series on the one hand and the degree of cointegration on the other. To check time series for stationarity requirement, we use augmented Dickey–Fuller test, Phillips–Perron test, Ng–Perron test, and the test of Kwiatkowski-Phillips-Schmidt-Shin.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

As can be seen from the results of the analysis of sampled variables (Table 2), when using raw data, all tests indicate the nonstationarity of the time series. When translating the time series in logarithmic values, the data becomes stationary in any test for the presence of unit root. Thus, the analysis uses the time series of the logarithmic values of oil prices and stock market prices. The time period of the sample includes the range from January 01, 2003 on May 01, 2017. It is also important to note that the world price of oil (Brent) is denominated in US dollars instead of Russian rubles. This choice is justified by the desire to avoid the impact of exchange rate on stock returns and to use the oil price as exogenous variable.

To build the model it is also necessary to determine the optimal magnitude of the time lag with which oil prices can affect stock returns. We use the Akaike information criterion. According to the results of the analysis, the optimal lag may be a lag of 7 weeks. The next step in the study and analysis of the obtained results is the choice of a suitable model. It is necessary to determine the advantages of one model specification over another. In our case the choice is between GARCH (1,1)-in-mean VAR and traditional VAR models homoscedasticity. To determine the type of model best suited for the analysis of our variables, we use the Schwartz information criterion and appropriate values of the statistics.

Table 3: Results of model specification test

Bivariate VAR model	Schwarz criterion value			
	VAR	GARCH-in-mean VAR		
Oil prices and stock returns	9078.12	8742.98		

GARCH: Generalized autoregressive conditional heteroskedasticity, VAR: Vector auto regression

Schwartz information criterion is not adapted to the use of additional parameters in the assessment GARCH model, so the optimal, according to Elder and Serletis (2010) is the use bivariate GARCH (1,1)-in-mean VAR specifications. Table 3 presents the results of comparative analysis of advantages of different model specifications. As can be seen from Table 3, the criterion Schwarz spoke in favor of the VAR model GARCH-in-mean.

Further proof of the benefits of bivariate GARCH-in-mean VAR model over traditional are the results of the estimation of the parameters of variation, which are presented in Table 4. As can be seen from Table 4, the null hypothesis of the absence of ARCH and GARCH-M can be rejected. More precisely, from the test results it is seen that GARCH is present in stock returns and ARCH is present in oil prices. Also from the data analysis we can see at the level of weekly data that the volatility of oil prices is sustainable and permanent.

The shocks of uncertainty in oil prices are reflected as the conditional standard deviation of changes in oil prices $\sqrt{H_t}$. It is the ratio of conditional standard deviations in the equation of stock returns provides evidence of the effect of oil price uncertainty on stock returns. As can be seen from Table 4, a positive uncertainty shock in oil prices leads to a positive impact on stock returns in the Russian stock market with a value of 0.48, the value of t-statistics and probability -1.98 and probability P = 0.04. The statistical significance of this coefficient is marginal in nature. Thus, the results confirm previous research on the issue, the results of which confirm the existence of dependence of stock returns in the oil-exporting country on the level of oil prices. In the case of rising oil prices, the return on the stock market is growing. The insignificance of growth may be explained by the heterogeneity of tradable shares and a plurality of sectors of the economy, or dominance of the oil sector on the stock market.

To assess the degree of symmetry/asymmetry in the reaction of stock returns to a shock of uncertainty in oil prices one should apply to the analysis of the results of impulse response functions that are simulated from maximum likelihood estimates of the parameters of the model. In order to obtain comparable to homoscedastic VAR

Table 4: Coefficient estimates for variance of GARCH-in-mean VAR

Equation Type	Conditional variance	Constant	$\varepsilon_{i}(t-1)^{2}$	<i>H</i> ₁₁ (<i>t</i> -1)
OILP equation	$H_{11}(t)$	12.34* (21.39)	0.48* (5.12)	<u>.</u> 00
SP equation	$H_{2,2}^{(1)}(t)$	0.17* (1.82)	0.19* (5.69)	1.05* (32.44)

Asymptotic t-statistics are in parentheses. *Indicates significance at 5% level. GARCH: Generalized autoregressive conditional heteroskedasticity, VAR: Vector auto regression

Figure 1: (a and b) Response of stock returns to positive and negative oil price shocks



model, impulses, the magnitude of the impulse response should be based on the shock in oil prices, which is the unconditional standard deviation of changes in oil prices. In order to establish whether the response to positive and negative shocks is symmetric or asymmetric, we analyze the sensitivity of stock returns to both positive and to negative shocks of uncertainty in oil prices. The results of the sensitivity of stock returns to negative and positive shocks of uncertainty in oil prices are presented in Figure 1a and b.

As can be seen from the data analysis of the sensitivity of stock returns to shocks in oil prices, a positive shock in oil prices leads to a significant and rapid growth of profitability of shares traded on the Moscow Exchange. It is important to note that this result is achieved within the first 2 weeks. In the medium term, the effect fizzles, i.e., is short-term.

If we turn to the results of the simulation of a negative oil shock, we can see that the fall in oil prices leads to a significant drop in stock returns in the short term and that the effect lasts longer than in the case of recovery. When analyzing the presence of symmetry, we can state that the response to positive and negative shock of crude oil prices from the yield of Russian shares is disproportionate, as not identical in absolute values. The negative effect is bigger than the positive shock.

5. CONCLUSION

In this article we set ourselves the task to conduct a study to identify the relationship between the volatility of world oil prices and stock returns traded on the Moscow Exchange on the example of Russia. The study showed that positive and negative shocks of oil prices have a statistically significant impact on the profitability of stocks traded on the Moscow Exchange. In the case of oilexporting countries, which Russia is, a positive shock in oil prices leads to significant growth of stock returns, while negative shock in oil prices leads to a fall in stock returns. A logical explanation for this empirical relationship is, in our opinion, the large-scale presence and the proportion of oil companies among the total pool of tradable shares. Another finding of the study is the identification of asymmetric reactions of stock returns to positive and negative shocks of volatility of oil prices. In the case of a negative shock in oil prices, the effect is short, but significant. In the case of a positive shock in oil prices, the effect is long-term, but less in scale. The reasons for such asymmetry is related to many exogenous and endogenous factors and is a question requiring further research.

REFERENCES

- Agren, M. (2006), Does Oil Price Uncertainty Transmit to Stock Markets? Working Paper, Department of Economics, Uppsala University, No. 2006, 23. Available from: http://www.econstor.eu/ bitstream/10419/82778/1/wp2006-023.pdf.
- Arouri, M.E.H., Jouini, J., Ngugen, D.K. (2011), Volatility spillovers between oil prices and stock sector returns: Implications for portfolio management. Journal of International Money and Finance, 30(7), 1387-1405.
- Arouri, M.E.H., Jouini, J., Ngugen, D.K. (2012), On the impacts of oil price fluctuations on European equity markets: Volatility spillover and hedging effectiveness. Energy Economics, 34, 611-617.
- Arouri, M.E.H., Nguyen, D.K. (2010), Oil prices, stock markets and portfolio investment: Evidence from sector analysis in Europe over the last decade. Energy Policy, 38, 4528-4539.
- Backus, K.D., Crucini, M.J. (2000), Oil prices and the terms of trade. Journal of International Economics, 50, 185-213.
- Basher, S.A., Sadorsky, P. (2006), Oil price risk and emerging stock markets. Global Finance Journal, 17, 224-251.
- Baskaya, Y.S., Hülagü, T., Küçük, H. (2013), Oil price uncertainty in a small open economy. Central Bank of the Republic of Turkey 2013, Working Paper No. 13/09.
- Bernanke, S.B. (2006), The Economic Outlook. New York: Remarks before the National Italian American Foundation.
- Bjornland, C.H. (2009), Oil price shocks and stock market booms in an oil exporting country. Scottish Journal of Political Economy, 2(5), 232-254.
- Brown, P.A.S., Yücel, M.K. (2002), Energy prices and aggregate economic activity: An interpretative survey. The Quarterly Review of Economics and Finance, 42, 193-208.
- Burakov, D. (2016), Oil prices, economic growth and emigration: An empirical study of transmission channel. International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy, 7(1), 90-98.
- Burakov, D. (2016), Oil prices, exchange rate and prices for agricultural commodities: Empirical evidence from Russia. AGRIS On-line Papers in Economics and Informatics, 8(2), 33-47.
- Chang, C.L., McAleer, M., Tansuchat, R. (2009), Volatility Spillovers between Crude Oil Futures Returns and Oil Company Stock Returns, Working Paper CARF-F-157, University of Tokyo.
- Choi, K., Hammoudeh, S. (2010), Volatility behavior of oil, industrial commodity and stock markets in a regime-switching environment. Energy Policy, 38, 4388-4399.
- Davis, J.S., Haltiwanger, J. (2001), Sectoral job creation and destruction responses to oil price changes. Journal of Monetary Economics, 48, 465-512.

Edelstein, P., Kilian, L. (2007), The response of business fixed

investment to changes in energy prices: A test of some hypothesis about the transmission of energy price shocks. The B.E. Journal of Macroeconomics, Berkeley Electronic Press, 7(1), 35.

- Elder, J. (1995), Macroeconomic and Financial Effects of Monetary Policy and Monetary Policy Uncertainty. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, Department of Economics University of Virginia.
- Elder, J. (2003), An impulse response function for a vector auto regression with multivariate GARCH-in-mean. Economic Letters, 79, 21-26.
- Elder, J. (2004), Another perspective on the effects of inflation volatility. Journal of Money, Credit, and Banking, 36, 911-928.
- Elder, J., Serletis, A. (2010), Oil price uncertainty. Journal of Money Credit and Banking, 42(6), 1137-1159.
- Engle, R.F., Ng, V. (1995), Multivariate simultaneous generalized ARCH. Economic Theory, 11(1), 122-150.
- Filis, G., Degiannakis, S., Floros, C. (2011), Dynamic correlation between stock market and oil prices: The case of oil-importing and oil-exporting countries. International Review of Financial Analysis, 20, 152-164.
- Fisher, I. (1930), The Theory of Interest. New York: Macmillan.
- Guo, H., Kliesen, K.L. (2005), Oil price volatility and U.S. Macroeconomic activity. Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis Review, 87(6), 669-683.
- Gupta, R., Modise, M.P. (2013), Does the source of oil price shocks matter for South African stock returns? A structural VAR approach. Energy Economics, 40(1), 825-831.
- Hamilton, D.J. (1988), A neoclassical model of unemployment and the business cycle. Journal of Political Economy, 96, 593-617.
- Hamilton, J.D. (1994), Time Series Analysis. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Hooker, A.M. (2002), Are oil shocks inflationary? Asymmetric and nonlinear specifications versus changes in regime. Journal of Money, Credit and Banking, 34(2), 540-561.
- Jimenez-Rodriguez, R., Sanchez, M. (2005), Oil price shocks and real GDP growth: Empirical evidence for some OECD countries, Applied Economics, 37(2), 201-228.
- Jiranyakul, K. (2014), Does Oil Price Uncertainty Transmit to the Thai Stock Market? MPRA Paper No. 56527. Available from: http://www.mpra.ub.uni-muenchen.de/56527.
- Jones, M.C., Kaul, G. (1996), Oil and stock markets. The Journal of Finance, 51(2), 463-491.

Jouini, J. (2013), Return and volatility interaction between oil prices and

stock markets in Saudi Arabia. Journal of Policy Modeling, 35(6), 1124-1144.

- Kim, I.M., Loungani, P. (1992), The role of energy in real business cycle models. Journal of Monetary Economics, 29, 173-189.
- Lardic, S., Mignon, V. (2006), Oil prices and economic activity: An asymmetric cointegration approach. Energy Economics, 34, 3910-3915.
- LeBlanc, M., Chinn, D.M. (2004), Do high oil prices presage inflation? The evidence from G5 countries. Business Economics, 34, 38-48.
- Lee, Y.H., Chiou, J.S. (2011), Oil sensitivity and its asymmetric impact on the stock market. Energy, 36, 168-174.
- Lin, B., Wesseh, P.K.Jr., Appiah, M.O. (2014), Oil price fluctuation, volatility spillover and the Ghanaian equity market: Implication for portfolio management and hedging effectiveness. Energy Economics, 42, 172-182.
- Malik, F., Ewing, B. (2009), Volatility transmission between oil prices and equity sector returns. International Review of Financial Analysis, 18(3), 95-100.
- Masih, R., Peters, S., de Mello, L. (2011), Oil price volatility and stock price fluctuations in an emerging market: Evidence from South Korea. Energy Economics, 33(5), 975-986.
- Olson, E., Vivian, A.J., Wohar, M.E. (2014), The relationship between energy and equity markets: Evidence from volatility impulse response functions. Energy Economics, 43, 297-305.
- Ozturk, I., Feridun, M. (2010), Impact of oil prices on inflation in oilimporting countries: The case of Turkey. Journal of Economic Computation and Economic Cybernetics Studies and Research, 2, 201-208.
- Pagan, A. (1984), Econometric issues in the analysis of regressions with generated regressors. International Economic Review, 25, 221-247.
- Ross, S. (1989), Information and volatility: The no-arbitrage martingale approach to timing and resolution irrelevancy. Journal of Finance, 44, 1-17.
- Sadorsky, P. (1999), Oil price shocks and stock market activity. Energy Economics, 21, 449-469.
- Swanepoel, J.A. (2006), The impact of external shocks on South African inflation at different price stages. Journal for Studies in Economics and Econometrics, 30(1), 1-22.
- Williams, B.J. (1938), The Theory of Investment Value. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.